

APPENDIX

Case Study: O'Devaney Gardens, Dublin 7

The Housing Land Initiative is a Public Private "Partnership" proposed by Dublin City Council to develop housing on land at O'Devaney Gardens (Dublin 7), St Michael's Development (Dublin 8) and the Oscar Traynor Road (Dublin 9).

While the proposal for O'Devaney Gardens has not yet been finalised, the council has given some indications of how it plans to use the land. These include;

- The transfer of the land at no cost from the state to a private developer or not-for-profit;
- A mixture of public and private homes, including 30% council housing, and the rest a mixture of so-called "affordable starter homes" valued at around €260,000, and 'affordable private rental' homes, in which the state pays a portion of tenants' rent to the private landlord.

O'Devaney Gardens is a longstanding public housing scheme, subject to repeated funding and regeneration failures. The new Housing Land Initiative represents a massive reduction in the state's commitment to providing accessible housing on the site.

Here is a brief comparison of how the Solidarity Housing model compares to the council's proposal for O'Devaney Gardens.

	Solidarity Housing	Housing Land Initiative
What determines who has access to new housing?	50% of housing is assigned to those on below average incomes, and 50% to those on above average incomes.	30% of housing is reserved for households on below average incomes, and 70% given to households on above average and high incomes – so higher earners receive a greater quantity of housing built. So-called "affordable" homes, costing an estimated €260,000, will in fact be affordable only to the top 30% of earners.
Does the scheme represent financial sense for the state?	Income from all tenants is determined as a percentage of income, and is paid to the state. Any surplus revenue can be reinvested in building or maintenance.	Under the 'private affordable rental' model proposed under the Housing Land Initiative rents paid to private landlords are topped up by state top-ups. This is a further expansion of the system of state subsidies to landlords.
How is land managed?	The land at O'Devaney Gardens remains under public ownership	Public land is transferred at no cost to a private developer, who retains all current and future profits associated with it.
What sort of community is created?	All households have the same tenure, rights and quality housing without distinction based on income.	Even though there is a mixture of incomes, there are different housing schemes, tenures and housing types, creating stigma and division.